1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8	GEORGE A. RILEY (Bar No. 118304) griley@omm.com MICHAEL F. TUBACH (Bar No. 145955) mtubach@omm.com CHRISTINA J. BROWN (Bar No. 242130) cjbrown@omm.com O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111-3823 Telephone: (415) 984-8700 Facsimile: (415) 984-8701 Attorneys for Defendant Apple Inc.	
10		STRICT OF CALIFORNIA
11		IOSE DIVISION
12	SAN	OSE DIVISION
13	IN RE HIGH-TECH EMPLOYEE	Master Docket No. 11-CV-2509-LHK
14	ANTITRUST LITIGATION	DECLARATION OF CHRISTINA BROWN
15 16 17	THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO: ALL ACTIONS	IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS' JOINT RENEWED MOTION TO SEAL MATERIALS IN CONNECTION WITH SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND DAUBERT MOTIONS AND DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO STRIKE
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		BROWN DECL. ISO DEFENDANTS'
		IOINT DENEWED MOTION TO SEAT

NO. 11-CV-2509-LHK

I, Christina Brown, declare as follows:

- 1. I am a member of the Bar of the State of California and a counsel of the law firm of O'Melveny & Myers LLP, attorneys for Defendant Apple Inc. I submit this declaration in support of Defendants' Joint Renewed Motion to Seal Materials In Connection with Summary Judgment and Daubert Motions and Defendants' Motion to Strike (Dkt. 790) ("Renewed Motion"). I make this declaration based on my own personal knowledge and information provided to me. If called to testify as a witness, I could and would do so competently.
- 2. Apple seeks to seal only limited portions of certain materials filed in connection with the parties' motions for summary judgment, *Daubert* motions, and Defendants' motion to strike the improper rebuttal testimony in Dr. Leamer's reply expert report, as set forth below and reflected in the proposed redacted and highlighted versions of these documents filed in support of the Renewed Motion. I have reviewed these documents, and I believe there are compelling reasons to maintain under seal the portions set forth below. These portions contain and reflect information designated by Apple as CONFIDENTIAL ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY under the Stipulated Protective Order entered by the Court on January 24, 2012 (Dkt. 107).
- 3. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive information contained in the October 1, 2012, Initial Class Certification Expert Report of Edward E. Leamer:
 - Page 23, figures 3 and 4 (lines pertaining to Apple) disclose the total compensation of Apple employees in each of Plaintiffs' (then) proposed classes and reflect Apple's highly confidential employee data;
 - Page 51, footnote 164 (end of last parenthetical) describes one of Apple's specific strategies with respect to determining employee salaries;
 - Page 53, figure 10 (line pertaining to Apple) reflects Apple's highly confidential employee compensation data and practices regarding bonus and equity compensation;
 - Page 59, figure 15 discloses Apple's highly confidential employee compensation data;
 and
 - Page 61, figure 17 reflects Apple's highly confidential employee salary data.

1	4.	Apple seeks to sear the following fightly confidential, competitively sensitive
2	informatio	on contained in the December 10, 2012, Reply Expert Report of Edward E. Leamer:
3	•	Page 26, figure 1 (chart pertaining to Apple) reflects Apple's highly confidential
4		employee compensation data as to base salary increases;
5	•	Page 29, paragraph 64 (portions of the first and third sentences) reflects Apple's
6		highly confidential employee compensation strategy and data;
7	• Page 42, figure 6 (chart pertaining to Apple) reflects Apple's highly confidential	
8		strategies for determining and awarding employee compensation; and
9	•	Page 43, figure 7 (chart pertaining to Apple) reflects Apple's highly confidential
10		strategies for determining and awarding employee equity compensation.
11	5.	Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
12	information contained in the May 10, 2013, Supplemental Expert Report of Edward E.	
13	Leamer:	
14	•	Exhibit 2 discloses Apple's job titles and related employee-years and compensation
15		correlations and reflects Apple's highly confidential employee compensation data.
16	6. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive	
17	informatio	on contained in the July 12, 2013, Rebuttal Supplemental Expert Report of Edward
18	E. Leame	r :
19	•	Page 35, figure 7 discloses Apple's highly confidential and competitively sensitive
20		employee compensation data regarding base salaries.
21	7.	Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
22	informatio	on contained in the October 28, 2013, Initial Merits Expert Report of Edward E.
23	Leamer:	
24	•	Page 5, figure 2 (line pertaining to Apple) discloses the total compensation of the
25		Apple employees in the class and reflects Apple's highly confidential employee data.
26	8.	Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
27	informatio	on contained in the December 11, 2013, Reply Expert Report of Edward E. Leamer:

1	 Paragraph 30 reflects Apple's employee job levels, compensation strategies, and
2	compensation data;
3	 Paragraphs 49 and 51 describe Apple's employee job levels, salary data, and
4	compensation strategies;
5	• Figure 3 discloses Apple's employee job levels, compensation strategies, and
6	compensation data;
7	• Figure 4 discloses Apple's salary and bonus levels and reflects Apple's highly
8	confidential employee compensation data;
9	• Figures 5 and 6 disclose Apple's employee job levels and salary data; and
10	 Figure 9 discloses Apple's employee evaluation and compensation strategies;
11	11. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
12	information contained in the October 28, 2013, Expert Report of Alan Manning, Ph.D.:
13	 Paragraph 42 discloses Apple's strategies and practices with respect to employee
14	compensation and retention.
15	12. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
16	information contained in the December 11, 2013, Rebuttal Expert Report of Alan Manning,
17	Ph.D.:
18	• Exhibit 3 discloses Apple's confidential information regarding the number and
19	classification of certain employees.
20	13. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
21	information contained in the November 25, 2013 Expert Report of Elizabeth Becker:
22	• Paragraph 34 (redacted portion) reflects Apple's highly confidential employee job title
23	data;
24	• Paragraphs 62 and 64-70 and footnote 59 (redacted portions) disclose Apple's highly
25	confidential job title and level structure, specific employee job titles, and specific
26	employee salaries and reflect its highly confidential employee data;
27	Paragraph 109 (redacted portions) discloses Apple's highly confidential strategies and
28	data regarding equity compensation;
	BROWN DECL. ISO DEFENDANTS'

and reflects its highly confidential employee data and hiring strategies;

27

1	•	Figure 3 discloses Apple's sources of employee hiring and reflects its highly
2		confidential employee data and hiring strategies;
3	•	Paragraph 46 (redacted number) discloses Apple's sources of employee hiring and
4		reflects its highly confidential employee data; and
5	•	Exhibits 3B, 3D, 4B, and 5B disclose Apple's sources of employee hiring and reflect
6		its highly confidential employee hiring strategies and data.
7	15.	Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
8	information	n contained in the November 25, 2013, Expert Report of Professor Kevin M.
9	Murphy:	
10	•	Paragraph 20 (redacted portions) discloses Apple's sources and magnitude of
11		employee hiring and reflects its highly confidential employee hiring strategies;
12	•	Exhibit 2 discloses Apple's sources of employee hiring and reflects its highly
13		confidential employee hiring strategies;
14	•	Exhibit 3 discloses Apple's sources of employee hiring and highly confidential
15		employee data and reflects its highly confidential employee hiring strategies; and
16	•	Exhibit 5 discloses Apple's highly confidential employee data.
17	16.	Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
18	information	n contained in the November 12, 2012, Expert Report of Professor Kevin M.
19	Murphy:	
20	•	Paragraph 46 (third sentence) reflects Apple's highly confidential employee
21		compensation strategies and data;
22	•	Exhibit 3 (chart pertaining to Apple) reflects Apple's highly confidential employee
23		hiring strategies and employee data;
24	•	Exhibit 5 (portions pertaining to Apple) reflects Apple's highly confidential employee
25		hiring strategies and employee data;
26	•	Exhibit 6 (portions pertaining to Apple) reflects Apple's highly confidential employee
27		data;
28		

1	• Exhibits 7A and 7B (portions pertaining to Apple) reflect Apple's highly confidential
2	employee compensation data;
3	 Exhibits 8A and 8B (portions pertaining to Apple) reflect Apple's highly confidential
4	employee compensation data;
5	 Exhibit 9A reflects Apple's highly confidential employee compensation data;
6	 Exhibit 11A reflects Apple's highly confidential employee compensation data;
7	 Appendices 1A through 2D (portions pertaining to Apple) reflect Apple's highly
8	confidential employee hiring strategies and employee data;
9	 Appendices 3A and 3B (portions pertaining to Apple) reflect Apple's highly
10	confidential employee compensation data; and
11	 Appendices 4A through 4D (portions pertaining to Apple) reflect Apple's highly
12	confidential employee compensation data.
13	17. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
14	information contained in the June 21, 2013, Expert Report of Professor Kevin M. Murphy:
15	• Exhibit 1 (Apple chart) discloses Apple's employee compensation and reflects
16	Apple's highly confidential employee compensation data;
17	• Exhibit 2 (Apple charts) discloses Apple's job titles and related highly confidential
18	employee compensation data;
19	• Appendix A, page 1, discloses Apple's job levels, as well as information about several
20	individual Apple employees;
21	• Appendix A, Exhibits 1 and 2 (redacted portions), reflects Apple's confidential,
22	individual-level employee compensation and job levels; and
23	Appendix B (redacted portions of Apple rows) reflects Apple's average employee
24	compensation by job level and describes Apple's confidential job titles.
25	18. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive
26	information contained in the November 25, 2013 Expert Report of Lauren J. Stiroh, Ph.D.:
27	• Paragraph 32 and footnote 69 (redacted portions) describe Apple's confidential
28	strategies for determining employee salaries;

1	•	Footnote 70 (redacted portion) describes Apple's confidential practices for
2		determining employee salary increases;
3	•	Paragraph 33 (redacted portions) discloses the magnitude of Apple's changes in
4		employee salaries and reflects Apple's highly confidential employee data;
5	•	Paragraph 34 (redacted portions) describes Apple's confidential practices and
6		strategies for awarding employee bonus compensation;
7	•	Paragraph 35 and footnotes 76 - 79 (redacted portions) describe Apple's confidential
8		practices and strategies for awarding employee equity compensation;
9	•	Paragraph 121 (redacted portion) discloses changes in base salaries for Apple
10		employees in a particular employee cohort and reflects Apple's highly confidential
11		employee data;
12	•	Footnote 225 (redacted portion) discloses changes in total compensation for Apple
13		employees in a particular employee cohort and reflects Apple's highly confidential
14		employee data;
15	•	Paragraph 134 (redacted portion) discloses changes in equity compensation for Apple
16		employees in a particular employee cohort and reflects Apple's highly confidential
17		employee data;
18	•	Exhibits III.10, III.12, III.13, III.14, III.15, and III.16 depict the amounts of total
19		compensation, base salary, bonus, cash compensation, and equity compensation paid
20		to Apple employees over the years 2001 through 2011 and reflect Apple's highly
21		confidential employee data;
22	•	Exhibit IV.1 (pages pertaining to Apple) disclose Apple's sources of employee hiring
23		and reflect its highly confidential employee hiring strategies and employee data;
24	•	Exhibit IV.7 reflects Apple's highly confidential employee data, including particular
25		employee salaries and growth;
26	•	Exhibit IV.11 reflects Apple's highly confidential employee data, including total
27		compensation growth for particular employees;
28		

- Exhibit IV.15 (pages pertaining to Apple) disclose the entire set of Apple's precise employee job titles for the class and the number of employees and changes in total compensation by year for each;
- Exhibit IV.21 reflects Apple's highly confidential employee data, including changes in specific job titles for certain employees;
- Exhibit IV.26 reflects Apple's highly confidential employee data, including growth in equity compensation awarded to particular employees over time; and
- Exhibit IV.30 (Apple column) discloses the percentage of Apple employees receiving equity compensation by year and reflects Apple's highly confidential employee data.
- 19. Apple seeks to seal the following highly confidential, competitively sensitive information contained in the exhibits to the Declaration of Lisa J. Cisneros in Support of Plaintiffs' Opposition Briefs Re Dkts. 554, 556, 557, 559, 560, 561, 564, 570 ("Cisneros Exhibits"):
- a. **Cisneros Exhibit J** (deposition excerpts of Darrin Baja), page 42, reflects Apple's confidential and competitively sensitive employee compensation strategies;
- b. **Cisneros Exhibit K** (deposition excerpts of Richard Bechtel), pages 39, 80, 82-83, and 215-217, reflects Apple's confidential and competitively sensitive practices and strategies for determining employee compensation; and at page 80, reflects the deponent's personal employment information;
- c. **Cisneros Exhibit L** (deposition excerpts of Mark Bentley), pages 262-263, reflects Apple's confidential and competitively sensitive practices and strategies for determining employee salaries;
- d. **Cisneros Exhibit M** (deposition excerpts of Patrick Burke), pages 43 and 161, reflects Apple's confidential and competitively sensitive strategies for determining employee job levels and employee compensation;
- e. **Cisneros Exhibit N** (deposition excerpts of Steve Burmeister), pages 32-36, 41-44, 51, 58, 64, 75-78, 88-90, 101-102, 112, 122-127, 152-154, 156, and 190-191, reflects Apple's

1	confidential and competitively sensitive strategies for determining employee job levels and	
2	compensation and Apple's highly confidential employee compensation data;	
3	f. Cisneros Exhibit Q (deposition excerpts of Tony Fadell), pages 53 and 117,	
4	reflects Apple's confidential and competitively sensitive practices and strategies with respect to	
5	employee hiring and determining employee salaries;	
6	g. Cisneros Exhibit S (deposition excerpts of Bob Mansfield), pages 36-37, 39, 41,	
7	and 45-46, reflects Apple's confidential and competitively sensitive strategies for determining	
8	employee job levels and compensation;	
9	h. Cisneros Exhibit T (deposition excerpts of Ron Okamoto), the specific	
10	percentage figures at pages 130-131 and 133-134, reflects Apple's confidential and competitively	
11	sensitive strategies for determining and adjusting employee compensation and employee	
12	promotions;	
13	i. Cisneros Exhibit 268 (231APPLE009277) reflects Apple's highly confidential	
14	employee job levels, salary data, and compensation practices;	
15	j. Cisneros Exhibit 278 (231APPLE002150) discloses personal identifying	
16	information of a former Apple employee;	
17	k. Cisneros Exhibit 279 (231APPLE002151) discloses personal identifying	
18	information of a former Apple employee;	
19	1. Cisneros Exhibit 861 (231APPLE095700) discloses confidential proposed	
20	compensation determinations for specific Apple employees;	
21	m. Cisneros Exhibit 1130 (231APPLE099371) discloses specific percentage figures	
22	reflecting Apple's highly confidential strategies and practices for determining employee	
23	compensation;	
24	n. Cisneros Exhibit 1376 (231APPLE039426) discusses Apple's highly confidential	
25	recruiting strategies and practices and particular job level, an individual's telephone number and	
26	passcode, and personal identifying information of a job candidate;	
27		

1	regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie
2	Fithian (Dkt. 679);
3	b. Harvey Exhibit 51 (ADOBE_110308), Master Agreement for Mutual Disclosure
4	of Information, Amendments One and Two to Master Agreement for Mutual Disclosure of
5	Information, First and Second Addenda to Master Agreement for Mutual Disclosure of
6	Information, and attached Exhibits and Appendices between Apple and Adobe, contains highly
7	confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as
8	set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
9	c. Harvey Exhibit 52 (ADOBE_110368), Agreement for Disclosure of Adobe
10	Information and Assignment between Apple and Adobe, contains highly confidential and
11	sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the
12	Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
13	d. Harvey Exhibit 53 (ADOBE_110398), Master Agreement for Mutual Disclosure
14	of Information and attached Exhibits and Appendices between Apple and Adobe, contains highly
15	confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as
16	set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
17	e. Harvey Exhibit 54 (ADOBE_110454), Joint Development and License
18	Agreement and attached Exhibits between Apple and Adobe, contains highly confidential and
19	sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the
20	Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
21	f. Harvey Exhibit 58 (231APPLE003854) (redacted portion on page 20) discloses
22	highly confidential data regarding Apple's recruiting efforts and job offers to particular
23	candidates;
24	g. Harvey Exhibit 59 (231APPLE007258) discloses Apple's highly confidential and
25	competitively sensitive specific employee job levels and salary data;
26	h. Harvey Exhibits 60 (231APPLE008537) discloses Apple's highly confidential
27	and competitively sensitive specific employee job levels and salary data;

- i. **Harvey Exhibit 61** (231APPLE008912) discloses Apple's highly confidential and competitively sensitive specific employee job levels and salary data;
- j. **Harvey Exhibit 62** (231APPLE011618) discloses Apple's highly confidential and competitively sensitive specific employee job levels and salary data;
- k. **Harvey Exhibit 63** (231APPLE056385) discloses Apple's confidential considerations with respect to hiring a specific employee and further reflects Apple's highly confidential compensation and recruiting strategies;
- l. **Harvey Exhibit 64** (231APPLE094041) discloses Apple's highly confidential employee compensation and review strategies;
- m. **Harvey Exhibit 66** (231APPLE100713) discloses Apple's highly confidential and competitively sensitive specific employee job levels and salary data;
- n. **Harvey Exhibit 67** (231APPLE105340) discloses Apple's highly confidential and competitively sensitive specific employee job levels and salary data;
- o. **Harvey Exhibit 68** (231APPLE108086) describes Apple's highly confidential and competitively sensitive strategies and considerations with respect to employee recruiting and hiring;
- p. **Harvey Exhibit 69** (231APPLE116655 231APPLE116801), Confidential Information Transmittal Record for Restricted Secret Information ("RS-CITR"), Amendment #1 to Exhibit 5 of Key Terms & Principles, and Master Development License Agreement and attached Exhibits between Apple and Intel, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
- q. **Harvey Exhibit 69** (231APPLE131828 231APPLE125054), Drafts of Amendment Five to Information Services Agreement, Amendment Three to License Agreement, and Amendment One to License Agreement between Apple and Google, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

- r. **Harvey Exhibit 70** (231APPLE123280), Mutual Non-Disclosure Agreement between Apple and Google, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
- s. **Harvey Exhibit 71** (231APPLE124988), License Agreement and attached Exhibits between Apple and Google, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
- t. **Harvey Exhibit 72** (231APPLE130883), License Agreement and attached Exhibits between Apple and Google, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
- u. **Harvey Exhibit 73** (231APPLE131137), My Location Protocol Terms of Service between Apple and Google, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
- v. **Harvey Exhibit 74** (231APPLE132589), Information Services Agreement and attached Exhibits between Apple and Google, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);
- w. **Harvey Exhibit 75** (231APPLE133899) reflects Apple's highly confidential and competitively sensitive business strategies and internal assessments of its competitive position in the market;
- x. **Harvey Exhibit 134** (GOOG-HIGH-TECH-00625486), Information Services Agreement and attached Exhibits between Apple and Google, contains highly confidential and sensitive information regarding Apple's business strategies and partnerships, as set forth in the Declaration of Leslie Fithian (Dkt. 679);

26

Case 5:11-cv-02509-LHK Document 857 Filed 04/10/14 Page 17 of 17

1	and competitively sensitive. Apple does not disclose this information publicly, to third parties, or		
2	even to most Apple employees, and limits its disclosure to employees who require it to carry out		
3	their job duties. Apple derives an economic benefit from maintaining the confidentiality of this		
4	information and would suffer serious competitive harm if it were disclosed because Apple's		
5	competitors, potential business partners, and other third parties would gain detailed information		
6	and insight its confidential and proprietary business strategies and partnerships, compensation		
7	strategies and practices, and recruiting strategies. Public disclosure of this information would put		
8	Apple at a significant disadvantage with respect to its business dealings and partnerships and to		
9	recruiting, hiring, and compensating its employees. Apple would therefore be prejudiced if this		
10	information were made available to the general public.		
11	22. Because these portions of the documents cannot be publicly disclosed without		
12	causing serious harm, as described above, Apple requests that they be maintained under seal and		
13	redacted from the publicly-filed versions of the documents.		
14	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States that the above is true		
15	and correct.		
16	Executed on April 10, 2014, in San Francisco, California.		
17			
18	By: /s/ Christina J. Brown		
19	Christina J. Brown		
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			